

PIA 2434/3434: Civil-Military Relations

Spring 2018

Thursdays, 12-3pm, 3600 Posvar Hall

Professor: Ryan Grauer
Office: 3932 Posvar Hall
Office Hours: Wednesdays and Thursdays, 3-5pm
Email: grauer@pitt.edu
Phone: 412-624-7396

Course Description:

This course explores the relationship between militaries and the polities they serve. Militaries are crucial governmental institutions in the modern world, serving as the guardians of sovereignty and safety. However, militaries also possess the tools and capability to threaten the very people and polities they are meant to protect. Striking the proper balance between military capability and civilian control of the armed forces is therefore an essential task for all political communities. But how is this delicate balancing act to be achieved? What factors make success and failure in this venture more or less likely? In exploring these questions, we will examine classical theories of civil-military relations and the rebuttals they inspired. We will also consider some of the key issues in the study and practice of civil-military relations, including coups, the influence of civilians on conventional and irregular battlefield performance, and various “gaps” between military and civilian values and beliefs. We will conclude by examining the confluence of the various facets of the American civil-military relationship and their manifestation since World War II.

Assignments and Grading:

This course will be a true seminar; though I may share some material not covered in the readings on occasion, I will not spend class time lecturing. Most of our meetings will consist of discussions in which we focus on teasing out both the precise arguments and counterarguments advanced in the readings, the validity and potential utility of the claims made by different scholars, and implications that might be derived for contemporary policymakers. The last two meetings will be dedicated to student-led presentations on specific civil-military relations they have researched.

Your grade will be based on the following three elements:

1. Three **reaction papers** (3-4 double-spaced pages), in which students respond to ideas, debates, conflicts, and contradictions in the material read for the week. The first paper will be written in response to a question distributed in class on February 1st and turned in during class on February 8th. The second paper will be written in response to the readings

and class discussion for one of the weeks between February 8th and February 22nd; it will be turned in the week following the meeting covering the topic on which you have chosen to write. The third paper will be written in response to the civil-military gap readings and discussions held on March 1 and March 15; it will be turned in on March 22nd. (10% each; 30% of total grade)

2. A **research paper** of no more than 25 double-spaced pages. It is due at the beginning of our final meeting of the semester, April 26th. It may be on a topic of your choosing, provided that it addresses the concepts and problems we discuss during the course. It can take the form of a single or comparative case study, a quantitative assessment of theoretical claims, or some mixture. Your intended topic must be approved by me *no later than March 1st*. You will present your findings to the class and field questions about your topic during one of our final two meetings. (50% of total grade)
3. **Class participation**, which consists both of regular participation in seminar discussions and weekly emails sent to seminar participants *by 7pm on Wednesdays* before meetings. The emails will list 3 questions about the material that you would like to discuss. Special emphasis will be given to participation and engagement during student presentations at the end of the semester. (20% of total grade)

Your final grade will be assigned on the following scale:

A	=	93-100	B+	=	87-89	C+	=	77-79	D+	=	67-69
A-	=	90-92	B	=	83-86	C	=	73-76	D	=	65-66
			B-	=	80-82	C-	=	70-72	F	=	Below 65

Academic Integrity:

You are expected to adhere to all aspects of the University of Pittsburgh guidelines on academic integrity. Failure to cite external sources of ideas, concepts, and facts in written work will be penalized. Plagiarism will result in automatic failure of the course. For Pitt's written guidelines on academic integrity, visit: <http://www.provost.pitt.edu/info/acguidelinespdf.pdf>.

Required Books:

The following books have been ordered and are available at The Book Center. They can also be purchased (usually for less) on Amazon or some other online site. Note that the Avant book required for Week 7 is out of print. There is only one copy available at Hillman, so you will need to use EZ Borrow or Inter-Library Loan relatively early in the semester to ensure that you have a copy in time to prepare for our meeting that week.

Rosa Brooks, *How Everything Became War and the Military Became Everything: Tales from the Pentagon* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2016).

Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).
H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollins, 1997).
Kori Schake and Jim Mattis, eds. *Warriors & Citizens: American Views of Our Military* (Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 2016).
Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

The other required readings for the course are available on CourseWeb.

Course Schedule

Week 1 (January 11): Introduction and Course Logistics [47]

Rosa Brooks, "Fog of War," *ForeignPolicy.com*, August 8, 2012.
Harold D. Lasswell, "The Garrison State," *American Journal of Sociology* 46, no. 4 (January, 1941): 455-468.
Gordon Craig, "The Political Leader as Strategist," in Peter Paret, ed., *Makers of Modern Strategy from Machiavelli to the Nuclear Age* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986): 481-509.
"Counsel of warriors: Donald Trump's generals cannot control him," *The Economist*, 9 November 2017.

General Issues

Week 2 (January 18): War-making States and State-making Wars [145]

Otto Hintze, "Military Organization and the Organization of the State," in Felix Gilbert, ed., *The Historical Essays of Otto Hintze* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975): 178-215.
Stanislav Andreski, *Military Organization and Society*, 2nd ed. (Berkeley: University of California, 1968): Introduction, Chapters 1, 2, 8. (1-74, 124-133)
Charles Tilly, "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime," in Peter Evans, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, & Theda Skocpol, eds., *Bringing the State Back In* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1985): 169-191.

Week 3 (January 25): Classical General Theories [168]

Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Samuel B. Griffith (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971): Chapter 3. (77-84)
Carl von Clausewitz, *On War* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984 [1832]): Book I, Chapter 1; Book VIII, Chapter 6b. (75-89, 605-610)
Samuel Huntington, *The Soldier and the State* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1957): Introduction, Chapters 1 – 5. (1-139)

Week 4 (February 1): Challenges to the Classics [176]

Morris Janowitz, *The Professional Soldier* (New York: The Free Press, 1971 [1960]): Chapters 1 – 4 and 20. (3-75, 417-442)

Peter D. Feaver, “The Civil-Military Problematique: Huntington, Janowitz, and the Question of Civilian Control,” *Armed Forces & Society* 23, no. 2 (Winter, 1996): 149-178.

Michael Desch, *Civilian Control of the Military: the Changing Security Environment* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1999): Chapters 1-2. (1-21)

Eliot Cohen, “The Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force,” in *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security*, eds. Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.

Challenges: Perpetual and Contemporary

Week 5 (February 8): Coups d'état [206]

Edward Luttwak, *Coup d'État: A Practical Handbook* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1969): Chapters 1-3. (3-101)

Samuel Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968): Chapter 4. (192-263)

James Quinlivan, “Coup-Proofing: Its Practice and Consequences in the Middle East,” *International Security* 24, no. 2 (Fall, 1999): 131-165.

Jesse Dillon Savage and Jonathan D. Caverley, “When Human Capital Threatens the Capitol: Foreign Aid in the Form of Military Training and Coups,” *Journal of Peace Research* 54, no. 4 (July, 2017): 542-557.

Week 6 (February 15): At War [203]

Setting the Stage:

Jack Snyder, “Civil-Military Relations and the Cult of the Offensive, 1914 and 1984,” *International Security* 9, no. 1 (Summer, 1984): 108-146.

Barry Posen, *The Sources of Military Doctrine: France, Britain, and Germany between the World Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1984): Chapter 7. (220-244)

Elizabeth Kier, “Culture and Military Doctrine: France Between the Wars,” *International Security* 19, no. 4 (Spring, 1995): 65-93.

During Battle:

Stephen Biddle and Robert Zirkle, “Technology, Civil-Military Relations, and Warfare in the Developing World,” *Journal of Strategic Studies* 19, no. 2 (June, 1996): 171-212.

Caitlin Talmadge, "The Puzzle of Personalist Performance: Iraqi Battlefield Effectiveness in the Iran-Iraq War," *Security Studies* 22, no. 2 (June, 2013): 180-221.

Vipin Narang and Caitlin Talmadge, "Civil-military Pathologies and Defeat in War: Tests Using New Data," *Journal of Conflict Resolution* Online First (January, 2017): 1-27.

Week 7 (February 22): Civilian Control in Irregular Wars [200]

*Deborah Avant, *Political Institutions and Military Change: Lessons from Peripheral Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994).

Robert Egnell, "Explaining US and British Performance in Complex Expeditionary Operations: The Civil-Military Dimension," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 29, no. 6 (December, 2006): 1041-1075.

Shawn T. Cochran, "The Civil-Military Divide in Protracted Small War: An Alternative View of Military Leadership Preferences and War Termination," *Armed Forces & Society* 40, no. 1 (January, 2014): 71-95.

* Out of Print; use the Library, EZ Borrow, and Inter-Library Loan early and often

Week 8 (March 1): The Civil-Military Gap I [290]

Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).

No Class March 8: Spring Break

Week 9 (March 15): The Civil-Military Gap II [245]

Kori Schake and Jim Mattis, eds. *Warriors & Citizens: American Views of Our Military* (Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 2016): Read Chapters 1, 2, 4-6, 8-9, 11; skim Chapters 3, 7, 10.

American Civil-Military Relations: Trends and Cases

Week 10 (March 22): Vietnam [334]

H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollins, 1997).

Week 11 (March 29): Obama and Afghanistan [380]

Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

Week 12 (April 5): No Class; Professor Grauer at ISA Annual Convention

Begin reading the material for next week and work on your paper!

Week 13 (April 12): Where are we now? [366]

Rosa Brooks, *How Everything Became War and the Military Became Everything: Tales from the Pentagon* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2016).

Week 14 (April 19): Student Presentations

Week 15 (April 26): Student Presentations