

# PIA 2434/3434: Civil-Military Relations

Spring 2016

Thursdays, 12-3pm, 3600 Posvar Hall

Professor: Ryan Grauer  
Office: 3932 Posvar Hall  
Office Hours: Wednesdays and Thursdays, 3-5pm  
Email: grauer@pitt.edu  
Phone: 412-624-7396

## **Course Description:**

This course explores the relationship between militaries and the polities they serve. Militaries are crucial governmental institutions in the modern world, serving as the guardians of sovereignty and safety. However, militaries also possess the tools and capability to threaten the very people and polities they are meant to protect. Striking the proper balance between military capability and civilian control of the armed forces is therefore an essential task for all political communities. But how is this delicate balancing act to be achieved? What factors make success and failure in this venture more or less likely? In exploring these questions, we will examine classical theories of civil-military relations and the rebuttals they inspired. We will also consider some of the key issues in the study and practice of civil-military relations, including coups, the influence of civilians on conventional and irregular battlefield performance, and various “gaps” between military and civilian values and beliefs. We will conclude by examining the confluence of the various facets of the American civil-military relationship and their manifestation since World War II.

## **Assignments and Grading:**

This course will be a true seminar; though I may share some material not covered in the readings on occasion, I will not spend any class time lecturing. Most of our meetings will consist of discussions in which we focus on teasing out both the precise arguments and counterarguments advanced in the readings, the validity and potential utility of the claims made by different scholars, and implications that might be derived for contemporary policymakers. The last two meetings will be dedicated to student-led presentations on specific civil-military relations they have researched.

Your grade will be based on the following three elements:

1. Three **reaction papers** (3-4 double-spaced pages), in which students respond to ideas, debates, conflicts, and contradictions in the material read for the week. The first paper will be written in response to a question distributed in class on January 28<sup>th</sup> and turned in during class on February 4<sup>th</sup>. The second and third papers will be written in response to

the readings and class discussion for two weeks of your choosing between February 4<sup>th</sup> and March 3<sup>rd</sup> (inclusive). They will be turned in during class the week following the meeting covering the topic on which you have chosen to write. (10% each; 30% of total grade)

2. A **research paper** of no more than 25 double-spaced pages. It is due at the beginning of our final meeting of the semester, April 28<sup>th</sup>. It may be on a topic of your choosing, provided that it addresses the concepts and problems we discuss during the course. It can take the form of a single or comparative case study, a quantitative assessment of theoretical claims, or some mixture. Your intended topic must be approved by me *no later than March 3<sup>rd</sup>*. You will present your findings to the class and field questions about your topic during one of our final two meetings. (50% of total grade)
3. **Class participation**, which consists both of regular participation in seminar discussions and weekly *emails sent to seminar participants by 7pm on Wednesdays* before meetings listing 3 questions about the material that you would like to discuss. Special emphasis will be given to engagement during student presentations at the end of the semester. (20% of total grade)

Your final grade will be assigned on the following scale:

A	=	93-100	B+	=	87-89	C+	=	77-79	D+	=	67-69
A-	=	90-92	B	=	83-86	C	=	73-76	D	=	65-66
			B-	=	80-82	C-	=	70-72	F	=	Below 65

### **Academic Integrity:**

You are expected to adhere to all aspects of the University of Pittsburgh guidelines on academic integrity. Failure to cite external sources of ideas, concepts, and facts in written work will be penalized. Plagiarism will result in automatic failure of the course. For Pitt's written guidelines on academic integrity, visit: <http://www.provost.pitt.edu/info/acguidelinespdf.pdf>.

### **Required Books:**

The following books have been ordered and are available at The Book Center. They can also be purchased (usually for less) on Amazon or some other online site. Note that the Avant book required for Week 7 is out of print. There is only one copy available at Hillman, so you will need to use EZ Borrow or Inter-Library Loan relatively early in the semester to ensure that you have a copy in time to prepare for our meeting that week.

Andrew J. Bacevich, *The New American Militarism*, updated ed. (New York: Oxford, 2013).

Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).  
Peter D. Feaver and Christopher Gelpi, *Choosing Your Battles: American Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004).  
Dale Herspring, *The Pentagon and the Presidency: Civil-Military Relations From FDR to George W. Bush* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2005).  
H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollins, 1997).  
Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

The other required readings for the course are available on CourseWeb.

### Course Schedule

#### **Week 1 (January 7):** Introduction and Course Logistics [55]

Rosa Brooks, "Fog of War," *ForeignPolicy.com*, August 8, 2012.  
Harold D. Lasswell, "The Garrison State," *American Journal of Sociology* 46, no. 4 (January, 1941): 455-468.  
Gordon Craig, "The Political Leader as Strategist," in Peter Paret, ed., *Makers of Modern Strategy from Machiavelli to the Nuclear Age* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986): 481-509.  
David Zucchino and David S. Cloud, "Special Report: U.S. Military and Civilians are Increasingly Divided," *Los Angeles Times*, 24 May 2015.

### General Issues

#### **Week 2 (January 14):** War-making States and State-making Wars [170]

Otto Hintze, "Military Organization and the Organization of the State," in Felix Gilbert, ed., *The Historical Essays of Otto Hintze* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975): 178-215.  
Stanislav Andreski, *Military Organization and Society*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Berkeley: University of California, 1968): Introduction, Chapters 1, 2, 8. (1-74, 124-133)  
Charles Tilly, "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime," in Peter Evans, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, & Theda Skocpol, eds., *Bringing the State Back In* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1985): 169-191.  
Janice E. Thomson, "State Practices, International Norms, and the Decline of Mercenarism," *International Studies Quarterly* 34, no. 1 (March, 1990): 23-47.

#### **Week 3 (January 21):** Classical General Theories [168]

Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Samuel B. Griffith (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971): Chapter 3. (77-84)

Carl von Clausewitz, *On War* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984 [1832]): Book I, Chapter 1; Book VIII, Chapter 6b. (75-89, 605-610)  
Samuel Huntington, *The Soldier and the State* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1957): Introduction, Chapters 1 – 5. (1-139)

**Week 4 (January 28):** Challenges to the Classics [227]

Morris Janowitz, *The Professional Soldier* (New York: The Free Press, 1971 [1960]): Chapters 1 – 4 and 20. (3-75, 417-442)  
Peter D. Feaver, “The Civil-Military Problematique: Huntington, Janowitz, and the Question of Civilian Control,” *Armed Forces & Society* 23, no. 2 (Winter, 1996): 149-178.  
Michael Desch, *Civilian Control of the Military: the Changing Security Environment* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1999): Chapters 1-2. (1-21)  
Eliot Cohen, “The Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force,” in *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security*, eds. Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.  
Christopher Gibson, “Enhancing National Security and Civilian Control of the Military: A Madisonian Approach,” in *American Civil-Military Relations: The Soldier and the State in a New Era*, ed. Suzanne Nielsen and Don Snider (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2009): 239-263.  
Richard Kohn, “Building Trust: Civil-Military Behaviors for Effective National Security,” in *American Civil-Military Relations: The Soldier and the State in a New Era*, ed. Suzanne Nielsen and Don Snider (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2009): 264-289.

*Challenges, Perpetual and Contemporary*

**Week 5 (February 4):** Coups d'état [274]

Edward Luttwak, *Coup d'État: A Practical Handbook* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1969): Chapters 1-3. (3-101)  
Samuel Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968): Chapter 4. (192-263)  
Eric Nordlinger, *Soldiers in Politics: Military Coups and Governments* (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1977): Chapter 3. (63-107).  
James Quinlivan, “Coup-Proofing: Its Practice and Consequences in the Middle East,” *International Security* 24, no. 2 (Fall, 1999): 131-165.  
Jonathan Powell, “Determinants of the Attempting and Outcomes of Coups d'état,” *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 56, no. 6 (December, 2012): 1017-1040.

**Week 6 (February 11):** At War [246]

*Setting the Stage:*

- Re-skim: Eliot Cohen, "The Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force," in *Soldiers and Civilians*, Peter Feaver and Richard Kohn, eds. (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.
- Jack Snyder, "Civil-Military Relations and the Cult of the Offensive, 1914 and 1984," *International Security* 9, no. 1 (Summer, 1984): 108-146.
- Barry Posen, *The Sources of Military Doctrine: France, Britain, and Germany between the World Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1984): Chapter 7. (220-244)
- Elizabeth Kier, "Culture and Military Doctrine: France Between the Wars," *International Security* 19, no. 4 (Spring, 1995): 65-93.
- Stephen Peter Rosen, "New Ways of War: Understanding Military Innovation," *International Security* 13, no. 1 (Summer, 1988): 134-168.

*During Battle:*

- Stephen Biddle and Robert Zirkle, "Technology, Civil-Military Relations, and Warfare in the Developing World," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 19, no. 2 (June, 1996): 171-212.
- Risa Brooks, "An Autocracy at War: Explaining Egypt's (in)Effectiveness in the 1967 and 1973 Arab-Israeli Wars" *Security Studies* 15, no. 3 (July-September 2006): 396-430.
- Caitlin Talmadge, "The Puzzle of Personalist Performance: Iraqi Battlefield Effectiveness in the Iran-Iraq War," *Security Studies* 22, no. 2 (June, 2013): 180-221.

**Week 7 (February 18):** Civilian Control in Irregular Wars [219]

- \*Deborah Avant, *Political Institutions and Military Change: Lessons from Peripheral Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994).
- Robert Egnell, "Explaining US and British Performance in Complex Expeditionary Operations: The Civil-Military Dimension," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 29, no. 6 (December, 2006): 1041-1075.
- Shawn T. Cochran, "The Civil-Military Divide in Protracted Small War: An Alternative View of Military Leadership Preferences and War Termination," *Armed Forces & Society* 40, no. 1 (January, 2014): 71-95.
- Charles J. Dunlap, Jr., "The Origins of the American Military Coup of 2012," *Parameters* 22, no. 4 (Winter, 1992-1993): 2-20.

\* Out of Print; use the Library, EZ Borrow, and Inter-Library Loan early and often

**Week 8 (February 25):** The Civil-Military Gap I [290]

Ole R. Holsti, "Of Chasms and Convergences: Attitudes and Beliefs of Civilians and Military Elites at the Start of a New Millennium," in *Soldiers and Civilians*, Peter Feaver and Richard Kohn, eds. (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 15-100.  
Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).

**Week 9 (March 3):** The Civil-Military Gap II [214]

Peter D. Feaver and Christopher Gelpi, *Choosing Your Battles: American Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004).

**No Class March 10: Spring Break**

**Week 10 (March 17): No Class; Professor Grauer at ISA Annual Convention**

Begin reading the extensive material assigned for the next four weeks!

*American Civil-Military Relations: Trends and Cases*

**Week 11 (March 24):** Modern American Civil-Military Relations [504]

Dale Herspring, *The Pentagon and the Presidency: Civil-Military Relations From FDR to George W. Bush* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2005).

**Week 12 (March 31):** Vietnam [334]

H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollins, 1997).

**Week 13 (April 7):** Militarized Civilians? [304]

Andrew J. Bacevich, *The New American Militarism*, updated ed. (New York: Oxford, 2013).

**Week 14 (April 14):** Obama and the 2009 Surge [380]

Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

**Week 15 (April 21):** Student Presentations

**Week 16 (April 28):** Student Presentations