

PIA 2434: Civil-Military Relations

Fall 2022

Thursdays, 12:00-2:55pm

Posvar 3911

Professor: Ryan Grauer
Office: 3932 Posvar Hall
Office Hours: Wednesdays, 3-5pm, and by appointment
Email: grauer@pitt.edu
Phone: 412-624-7396

Course Description:

This course explores the relationship between militaries and the polities they serve. Militaries are crucial governmental institutions in the modern world, serving as the guardians of sovereignty and safety. However, militaries also possess the tools and capability to threaten the very people and polities they are meant to protect. Striking the proper balance between military capability and civilian control of the armed forces is therefore an essential task for all political communities. The difficulty of doing so underscores the importance of knowing what the necessary delicate balance looks like as well as what factors make success and failure in such ventures more or less likely. In exploring this essential topic of good governance, we will examine the historical roots of civil-military relations, military takeovers of and defections from civilian governance institutions, and the theory and practice of civil-military relations in modern democratic societies (particularly the United States). Particular topics to be considered include coups d'état, military disobedience, civil-military relations in wartime, the "civil-military gap," and the role of servicemembers in the political life of the community. Throughout the course, we will ask and explore three specific questions: What is the dividing line between civilian and military spheres of activity? How much influence should civilians have on activities within the military sphere? How much influence should the military have in the civilian sphere? And we will grapple with the implications of the fact that there are few, if any, clear answers to these questions.

Course Expectations:

Of me, you can expect:

1. Punctuality in arriving to, beginning, and ending our meetings.
2. A prepared and thought-out lesson plan that will facilitate (with your cooperation and diligent work) both understanding of the material and success in the course.
3. Reasonably prompt responses to email inquiries (usually within a few hours, excepting the times at which normal people are asleep).
4. Accessibility in office hours or other scheduled meetings.

Of you, I expect:

1. Attendance. More than two absences will result in a zero for the class participation portion of your grade. Consistent tardiness will also negatively impact your participation grade.

2. Completion of all readings and arrival in class prepared to discuss the topic assigned for the week. I realize that not everyone is comfortable speaking in front of a group, but keep in mind that I value quality over quantity. That said, failure to participate on a regular basis will have a negative effect on your participation grade.
3. Timely completion of assignments. Without prior explicit permission for a delay, work turned in after the designated time will be docked one full letter grade for each day—or portion thereof—that it is late.
4. Cognitive focus. If you use a laptop for taking notes, refrain from checking emails and engaging in other non-class activity during our meetings. I strongly recommend, however, taking notes with a pen and paper—something research indicates is better for learning: <http://www.npr.org/2016/04/17/474525392/attention-students-put-your-laptops-away>.
5. Adherence to the University of Pittsburgh guidelines on academic integrity. Failure to cite external sources of ideas, concepts, and facts in written work will be penalized. Plagiarism will result in automatic failure of the assignment and particularly egregious instances of plagiarism may result in failure of the course. For Pitt's written guidelines on academic integrity, visit: https://www.provost.pitt.edu/sites/default/files/academic_integrity_guidelines.pdf. For GSPIA's policies on academic integrity, visit: https://gspia.pitt.edu/sites/default/files/2019-07/HandbookAcademicPoliciesProceduresMaster_Revised_2019.pdf.
6. Respect for your fellow classmates, the ideas and opinions discussed during meetings, and the works we are considering.

Assignments and Grading:

This course will be a true seminar; though I may share some material not covered in the readings on occasion, I will not spend class time lecturing. Most of our meetings will consist of discussions in which we focus on teasing out the precise ideas, arguments, and counterarguments advanced in the readings, the validity and potential utility of the claims made by different scholars, and implications that might be derived for contemporary policymakers. The penultimate meeting will be dedicated to student-led presentations on specific civil-military relations they have researched.

Your grade will be based on the following three elements:

1. **Two Reaction Papers (20%; 10% each):** Twice during the semester, you will write a paper of 3-4 double-spaced pages in which you respond to ideas, debates, conflicts, and contradictions in the material read for the week. The first paper will be written in response to readings and class discussion for one of the weeks between September 8th and October 6th (inclusive). It will be turned in *via email* prior to class the week following the meeting covering the topic on which you have chosen to write. The second paper will be written in response to readings and class discussion for one of the weeks between October 13th and November 17th (inclusive). It will be turned in *via email* prior to class the week following the meeting covering the topic on which you have chosen to write.
2. **Research Paper (60%):** The largest project of the semester will culminate in a research paper of no more than 15 double-spaced pages, due *via email* by 12pm Eastern Time on

Thursday, December 15th. It may be on a topic of your choosing, provided that it addresses the concepts and problems we discuss during the course. It can take the form of a single or comparative case study, a quantitative assessment of theoretical claims, or some mixture.

Students in the past have examined a wide range of topics, including:

- The crafting and passage of the Goldwater-Nichols Act
- The causes and consequences of Germany's ending of conscription
- The history of civil-military relations in Saudi Arabia
- Variation in the integration of women into combat arms around the world
- George Washington's relations with the Continental Congress
- Contemporary Indian civil-military relations
- Civilian oversight of counterinsurgency operations
- Civilian aversion to military service in post-Cold War Russia

This assignment has four constituent parts:

- One-page description of your intended topic, including a justification of why it merits investigation; due Thursday, October 6th **(5%)**
 - An annotated bibliography of at least twelve scholarly or other reputable sources you plan to use in writing your paper. The sources cannot be materials assigned in the course (though such sources can be used for your paper). Each entry should include 4-5 sentences that describe the key argument, insight, or information contained in the source and why it will be useful for your paper. Due Thursday, November 3rd **(10%)**
 - A presentation of your preliminary argument and findings; the length of the presentation will depend on the number of students enrolled in the class, but it will include the core argument and insight to be made in your paper and be given on Thursday, December 1st **(10%)**
 - The final paper, which builds on the work you have done throughout the semester and incorporates the feedback received during your presentation to the class; due Thursday, December 15th **(35%)**
3. **Class Participation (20%)** which consists both of regular participation in seminar discussions and weekly posts to the appropriate discussion threads on Canvas *by 7pm Eastern Time on Wednesdays* before meetings. The posts on the discussion threads, which will begin for Week 2, will list one (1) question about the reading material and/or podcast that you would like to discuss during our meeting (though you are welcome to post more than one question, if you would like!). I will use your questions to help structure our conversation. Special emphasis will be given to participation and engagement during student presentations on December 1st.

Your final grade will be assigned on the following scale:

A	=	93-100	B+	=	87-89	C+	=	77-79	D+	=	67-69
A-	=	90-92	B	=	83-86	C	=	73-76	D	=	65-66
			B-	=	80-82	C-	=	70-72	F	=	Below 65

Required Books:

There are three required books for this course. They are all available in multiple formats. They are available in e-book form through Hillman Library. They have also been ordered and are available at The Book Center. They can be purchased (usually for less) on the internet. If you are interested in supporting a local bookstore, I would recommend White Whale Bookstore in Bloomfield:

<https://www.whitewhalebookstore.com>. Alternatively, you could use The Tiny Bookstore, a Black- and woman-owned bookstore in Ross Township: <https://www.tinybookstoreonline.com>.

- Zoltan Barany, *How Armies Respond to Revolutions and Why* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016)
- Peter Bergen, *Trump and His Generals: The Cost of Chaos* (New York: Penguin, 2019)
- Jason K. Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010)

The other required readings for the course are available on Canvas. The assigned podcasts are accessible through the links provided on the syllabus, on Canvas, or through subscription on whatever podcast streaming service you use.

Disability Services:

If you have a disability for which you are or may be requesting an accommodation, you are encouraged to contact both the professor and Disability Resources and Services (140 William Pitt Union, 412-648-7890, drsrecep@pitt.edu) as early as possible in the term. Upon confirmation of the need for accommodation, we will collectively work to plan an appropriate course of action.

Classroom Recording:

To ensure the free and open discussion of ideas, students may not record classroom lectures, discussion, and/or activities without the advance written permission of the instructor, and any such recording properly approved in advance can be used solely for the student's own private use.

COVID Considerations:

As much as we all would like it to be, the pandemic is not yet over. Accordingly, we will be rigorously following all guidelines regarding when/if masking is required given the existing community levels. Additionally, all students are always welcome to mask if they so desire, regardless of Pitt's regulations at any given point in time. I, personally, will be masking throughout the semester, as I will be travelling between Chicago and Pittsburgh on a weekly basis and want to ensure that a) I avoid contracting Covid and am able to continue teaching the class in-person throughout the semester, and b) if I do happen to contract Covid during my travels, I do not inadvertently expose the class to the disease in the time period before I become aware of my status.

Course Schedule

Week 1 (September 1): Thinking about Civil-Military Relations [97 pages]

- Rosa Brooks, *How Everything Became War and the Military Became Everything* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2016): 3-22.
- Harold D. Lasswell, "The Garrison State," *American Journal of Sociology* 46, no. 4 (1941): 455-468.
- Gordon Craig, "The Political Leader as Strategist," in Peter Paret, ed., *Makers of Modern Strategy from Machiavelli to the Nuclear Age* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986): 481-509.
- Susan B. Glasser and Peter Baker, "Inside the War between Trump and His Generals," *The New Yorker*, 15 August 2022.

Week 2 (September 8): Civil-Military Relations, Historically Understood [90 pages]

- Otto Hintze, "Military Organization and the Organization of the State," in Felix Gilbert, ed., *The Historical Essays of Otto Hintze* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975): 178-215.
- Charles Tilly, "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime," in Peter Evans, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, & Theda Skocpol, eds., *Bringing the State Back In* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1985): 169-191.
- Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Samuel B. Griffith (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971): Chapter 3 (77-84)
- Carl von Clausewitz, *On War* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984 [1832]): Book I, Chapter 1; Book VIII, Chapter 6b. (75-89, 605-610)
- Podcast: *The History of Rome*, "The Best Defence is a Good Defence," available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/125-the-best-defence-is-a-good-defence/id261654474?i=1000343455243>

Week 3 (September 15): No Class; Prof. Grauer at APSA Annual Conference

Week 4 (September 22): Coups [143 pages]

- Edward Luttwak, *Coup d'État: A Practical Handbook* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1969): Chapters 1-2. (3-46)
- Samuel Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968): Chapter 4. (192-263)
- John J. Chin, David B. Carter, and Joseph G. Wright, "The Varieties of Coups D'état: Introducing the Colpus Dataset," *International Studies Quarterly* 65, no. 4 (2021): 1040-1051.
- Jesse Dillon Savage and Jonathan D. Caverley, "When Human Capital Threatens the Capitol: Foreign Aid in the Form of Military Training and Coups," *Journal of Peace Research* 54, no. 4 (2017): 542-557.

- Podcast: *The Lawfare Podcast*, “Zimbabwe and the Strategic Logic of Military Coups,” available: <https://www.lawfareblog.com/lawfare-podcast-naunihal-singh-zimbabwe-and-strategic-logic-military-coups>

Week 5 (September 29): Coup-Proofing [134 pages]

- James Quinlivan, “Coup-Proofing: Its Practice and Consequences in the Middle East,” *International Security* 24, no. 2 (1999): 131-165.
- Aaron Belkin and Evan Schofer, “Toward a Structural Understanding of Coup Risk,” *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 47, no. 5 (2003): 594-620.
- Holger Albrecht and Ferdinand Eibl, “How to Keep Officers in the Barracks: Causes, Agents, and Types of Military Coups,” *International Studies Quarterly* 62, no. 1 (2018): 315-328.
- Erica De Bruin, “Preventing Coups d’état: How Counterbalancing Works,” *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 62, no. 7 (2018): 1433-1458.
- Drew Holland Kinney, “Sharing Saddles: Oligarchs and Officers on Horseback in Egypt and Tunisia,” *International Studies Quarterly* 65, no. 2 (2021): 512-527.
- Austin S Matthews, “Don’t Turn Around, der Kommissar’s in Town: Political Officers and Coups d’Etat in Authoritarian Regimes,” *Journal of Peace Research* 59, no. 5 (2022): 663-678.
- Podcast: *SRB Podcast*, “Stalin’s Purge of the Red Army,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/stalins-purge-of-the-red-army/id597948126?i=1000439232121>

Week 6 (October 6): Military Defection and Mutinies [~135 pages]

- Zoltan Barany, *How Armies Respond to Revolutions and Why* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016): Introduction, Chapter 1, and ONE of empirical chapters (Chapters 2-5), Conclusion.
- Holger Albrecht and Dorothy Ohl, “Exit, Resistance, Loyalty: Military Behavior during Unrest in Authoritarian Regimes,” *Perspectives on Politics* 14, no. 1 (2016): 38-52.
- Rebeca Schiel, Jonathan Powell, and Christopher Faulkner, “Mutiny in Africa, 1950-2018,” *Conflict Management and Peace Science* 38, no. 4 (2021): 481-499.
- Maggie Dwyer and Oisín Tansey, “Explaining Divergent Trends in Coups and Mutinies: The End of the Cold War and the Role of Military Agency,” *Security Studies* 29, no. 5 (2020): 864-893.
- Podcast: *Revolutions*, “The Days of Freedom,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/10-38-the-days-of-freedom/id703889772?i=1000469893362>

Week 7 (October 13): Civilian Control I: A General Division of Labor? [131 pages]

- Samuel Huntington, *The Soldier and the State* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1957): Introduction, Chapters 1, 4. (1-3, 7-18, 80-97)
- Peter D. Feaver, “The Civil-Military Problematique: Huntington, Janowitz, and the Question of Civilian Control,” *Armed Forces & Society* 23, no. 2 (1996): 149-178.

- Eliot Cohen, “The Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force,” in *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security*, eds. Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.
- Risa Brooks, “Paradoxes of Professionalism: Rethinking Civil-Military Relations in the United States,” *International Security* 44, no. 4 (2020): 7-44.
- Podcast: *War on the Rocks Podcast*, “A Military Straining Against Civilian Control?” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/a-military-straining-against-civilian-control/id682478916?i=1000466501458>

Week 8 (October 20): Civilian Control II: Advice, Resignation, and Oversight [126 pages]

- James Golby and Mara Karlin, “Why ‘Best Military Advice’ is Bad for the Military—and Worse for Civilians,” *Orbis* 62, no. 1 (2018): 137-153.
- Erik Lin-Greenberg, “Soldiers, Pollsters, and International Crises: Public Opinion and the Military’s Advice on the Use of Force,” *Foreign Policy Analysis* 17, no. 3 (2021): orab009
- Don M. Snider, “Dissent, Resignation, and the Moral Agency of Senior Military Professionals,” *Armed Forces and Society* 43, no. 1 (2017): 5-16.
- James M. Dubik, “Taking a ‘Pro’ Position on Principled Resignation,” *Armed Forces and Society* 43, no. 1 (2017): 17-28.
- Peter D. Feaver, “Resign in Protest? A Cure Worse than Most Diseases,” *Armed Forces and Society* 43, no. 1 (2017): 29-40.
- Richard H. Kohn, “On Resignation,” *Armed Forces and Society* 43, no. 1 (2017): 41-52.
- Katherine Scott, “A Safety Valve: The Truman Committee’s Oversight during World War II,” in *Congress and Civil-Military Relations*, Colton C. Campbell and David P. Auerswald, eds., (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2015): 36-52.
- Danielle L. Lupton, “Out of the Service, Into the House: Military Experience and Congressional War Oversight,” *Political Research Quarterly* 70, no. 2 (2017): 327-339.
- Ronald R. Krebs, Robert Ralston, and Aaron Rapport, “No Right to be Wrong: What Americans Think about Civil-Military Relations,” *Perspectives on Politics* FirstView, 1-19. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537592721000013>
- Podcast: *The Lanfare Podcast*, “AUMF Reform After Afghanistan,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/aumf-reform-after-afghanistan/id498897343?i=1000533526774>

Week 9 (October 27): Civilians and the Military at War [162 pages]

- Jack Snyder, “Civil-Military Relations and the Cult of the Offensive, 1914 and 1984,” *International Security* 9, no. 1 (1984): 108-146.
- Barry Posen, *The Sources of Military Doctrine; France, Britain, and Germany between the World Wars* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1984): Chapter 7 (220-244).
- Elizabeth Kier, “Culture and Military Doctrine: France Between the Wars,” *International Security* 19, no. 4 (1995): 65-93.
- Caitlin Talmadge, “The Puzzle of Personalist Performance: Iraqi Battlefield Effectiveness in the Iran-Iraq War,” *Security Studies* 22, no. 2 (2013): 180-221.

- Vipin Narang and Caitlin Talmadge, “Civil-Military Pathologies and Defeat in War: Tests Using New Data,” *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 62, no. 7 (2018): 1379-1405.
- Podcast: *IS: Off the Page*, “U.S. Electoral Constraints, Military Strategy, and the Iraq War,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/09-u-s-electoral-constraints-military-strategy-iraq/id1484996253?i=1000478444038>

Week 10 (November 3): Who Serves? Why? [135 pages]

- *The Report of the President’s Commission on an All-Volunteer Force* (1970): Chapters 2, 13 (11-20, 159-167).
- Jason K. Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010): Chapters 1, 3, 8 (1-9, 34-44, 152-176).
- Andrea Asoni, Andrea Gilli, Mauro Gilli, & Tino Sanandaji, “A Mercenary Army of the Poor? Technological Change and the Demographic Composition of the Post-9/11 U.S. Military,” *Journal of Strategic Studies*, Latest Articles 30 January 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01402390.2019.1692660>.
- Ronald Krebs and Robert Ralston, “Patriotism or Paychecks: Who Believes What about Why Soldiers Serve,” *Armed Forces & Society* 48, no. 1 (2022): 25-48.
- Podcasts: Listen to both:
 - *Thank You for Your Service*, “Who Serves: Military Demographics in 2020,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/who-serves-military-demographics-in-2020/id1441805414?i=1000465400000>
 - *Thank You for Your Service*, “Women in the Military: Myths and Realities,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/women-in-the-military-myths-and-realities/id1441805414?i=1000466771620>
- Optional Podcast:
 - *Smart Women, Smart Power*: “Don’t Ask, Don’t Tell: An Insider’s View,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/dont-ask-dont-tell-an-insiders-view/id1577846548?i=1000569738022>

Week 11 (November 10): The Civil-Military Gap: Its Nature and Severity [143 pages]

- Thomas Ricks, “The Widening Gap Between Military and the Society,” *The Atlantic* (July, 1997): 66-78.
- Jason K. Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010): Chapters 4-6 (45-126).
- Jim Golby, Lindsay P. Cohn, and Peter D. Feaver, “Thanks for Your Service: Civilian and Veteran Attitudes after Fifteen Years of War,” in *Warriors & Citizens: American Views of Our Military*, Kori Schake and Jim Mattis, eds. (Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 2016): 97-141 (plus *W&C* survey information, 12-14).
- Podcast: *Thank You for Your Service*, “Supporting the Tropes: Hollywood and Our Military,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/supporting-the-tropes-hollywood-our-military/id1441805414?i=1000433973343>

Week 12 (November 17): The Military in Politics [132 pages]

- Jason K. Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010): Chapter 7 and Appendix E (127-151, 245-246)
- Heidi A. Urben, “Like, Comment, Retweet: The State of the Military’s Nonpartisan Ethic in the World of Social Media,” Center for Complex Operations Case Study (Washington, DC: National Defense University, 2017).
- Jim Golby, Kyle Dropp, and Peter D. Feaver, “Military Campaigns: Veterans’ Endorsements and Presidential Elections” (Washington, DC: Center for a New American Security, 2012).
- Zachary Griffiths and Olivia Simon, “Not Putting Their Money Where Their Mouth Is: Retired Flag Officers and Presidential Endorsements,” *Armed Forces & Society* 47, no. 3 (2021): 480-504.
- Peter White, “Generals in the Cabinet: Military Participation in Government and International Conflict Initiation,” *International Studies Quarterly* 65, no. 2 (2021): 551-561.
- Lindsay P. Cohn, “Statement before the Senate Armed Services Committee, Hearing on Civilian Control of the Armed Forces,” 12 January 2021.
- Podcast: *The Lanfare Podcast*, “Milley, Trump, and Civil-Military Relations with Peter Feaver, Kori Schake, and Alexander Vindman,” available: <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/milley-trump-and-civil-military-relations-with/id498897343?i=1000536122712>

No Meeting November 24: Thanksgiving

Week 13 (December 1): Student Presentations

Week 14 (December 8): Civil-Military Relations in the (Early) Trump Administration [311+ pages]

- Peter Bergen, *Trump and His Generals: The Cost of Chaos* (New York: Penguin, 2019)
- Review: Susan B. Glasser and Peter Baker, “Inside the War between Trump and His Generals,” *The New Yorker*, 15 August 2022.

Week 15 (December 15): Final Paper Due, 12:00pm